

**City of Saratoga Springs  
Planning Commission Meeting  
September 25, 2014**

Regular Session held at the City of Saratoga Springs City Offices  
1307 North Commerce Drive, Suite 200, Saratoga Springs, Utah 84045

---

**Planning Commission Minutes**

**Present:**

Commission Members: Jeff Cochran, Kirk Wilkins, Sandra Steele, Eric Reese, Hayden Williamson,

Staff: Sarah Carroll, Nicolette Fike

Others: Tyler White, Brian Morrow, Mike Kelly, Curtis Leavitt

**Excused:** Kara North, Jarred Henline

**Call to Order** - 6:32 p.m. by Jeff Cochran

**Pledge of Allegiance** – led by Tyler White

**Roll Call** – Quorum was present

**Public Input Open** by Jeff Cochran

No public input at this time.

**Public Input Closed** by Jeff Cochran

**4. Public Hearing and Possible Recommendation: Site Plan and Conditional Use for Vista Heights located at 612 West Pony Express Parkway, Evans and Association Architects, applicant.**

Sarah Carrol presented the plan to the commission. The site includes a church building, a pavilion, a storage building, and associated parking and landscaping. The applicant is requesting the sod requirement be reduced to 33% sod for this site. In exchange for this reduction they are willing to exceed all of the plant count requirements and are proposing: 99 deciduous trees at 2.5” caliper, 25 evergreen trees at 7’-8’ eight, 630 five-gallon shrubs, 70 perennial plants and 78 grasses.

Chad Spencer, for applicant, was present to answer questions.

**Public Hearing Open** by Jeff Cochran

No comments at this time.

**Public Hearing Closed** by Jeff Cochran

Kirk Wilkins thanked the applicant for changes made in lighting and the entrance move. He was ok with the sod reduction and increased plants to give shade and look nice.

Eric Reese asked about the entrances and if a median was put in on Pony Express which entrance would it impact.

Sarah Carrol said if it went in it would only impact one entrance and they weren’t totally sure which entrance that would be at this time.

Eric Reese appreciated the changes made to the plans as well and thought it was good.

Hayden Williamson appreciated the changes to lighting and parking, he was ok with the reduction in sod.

Sandra Steele was ok with the reduction in sod with the increased shrubs and trees. She had a problem with the accessible parking spaces, she noted they should be located on the shortest accessible route of travel and she didn’t believe this fit that requirement.

Jeff Cochran asked the applicant if there was a reason the handicapped stalls weren’t closer to the main entrance.

Chad Spencer said there were a number of reasons some were technical and that they met the intent of the code as it was but they would look at it. He knew there were some conflicts with unloading and issues with ramps and how the landscaping had to drain. They didn’t want ice to form and be a danger.

Jeff Cochran thanked him for his answers and appreciated the xeriscape and conservation of water.

Chad Spencer wanted to point out that they had to add 8 light poles to meet the minimum light standards.

**Motion by Kirk Wilkins Based upon the evidence and explanations received today, I move that the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council for approval of the Vista Heights Site Plan and Conditional Use Permit on property located at 612 West Pony Express Parkway, with the findings and conditions found in the Staff Report. Seconded by Hayden Williamson**

Sandra Steele asked if the motion could include trying to get the parking spaces on the shortest accessible route.

Kirk Wilkins asked applicant if he could work with staff to try and meet that request with staff without making it a condition.

Chad replied that he could.

Sarah Carroll thinks there could be a small change to meet that recommendation.

Kirk Wilkins thinks it meets the intent as stated and is not adding that condition as a requirement.

**Aye: Sandra Steele, Hayden Williamson, Eric Reese, Jeffrey Cochran, Kirk Wilkins. Motion passed unanimously**

**5. Public Hearing and Possible Recommendation: Preliminary Plat for Mallard Bay located at between 2800 South and 3000 South and Redwood Road, Holmes Homes, applicant. (Item Continued from the September 11, 2014 Planning Commission meeting)**

Sarah Carroll presented the Preliminary Plat. She shared changes that have been made to the plans, applicant requests and Staff recommendations. The applicant would like privacy fencing and an entrance sign.

Curtis Leavitt, for applicant, had a presentation to share. He shared their fencing proposal; their thoughts were that they would like to put in a concrete privacy style fence for aesthetics as well as a sound barrier for residences. He had a few examples from around the city. He had examples where homeowners put in a privacy fence behind a semi-private fence and wanted to avoid that problem. They would like to have an entrance monument for nice curb appeal.

Bryan Morrow, representing Rhino Rock Fencing, explained the product for fencing. He also noted areas where homeowners try to make their yards more private by placing other products behind the main semi-private fences.

Curtis Leavitt also spoke about the open spaces and how they wanted all the city residents to use it, and they are requesting that the City accept all of the open space as public open space.

**Public Hearing Open by Jeff Cochran**

No public comments given.

**Public Hearing Closed by Jeff Cochran**

Sandra Steele commended the developer on the naming of the development and the creative naming of the streets and the signage that gives it a nice sense of place. She thinks without an HOA the areas open space areas will deteriorate. She noted at the last Planning Commission meeting that there is pending ordinance that semi-privacy will be required along Redwood Road. She noted it was to protect the view. She is against the privacy fencing. She is concerned about the trails between the homes and who would maintain that area if they didn't have an HOA. As a general rule she is against HOA's but in small areas like this, with entrance area and trails she is concerned about it becoming a no-man's land and suggested an HOA to just take care of those areas. She noted that the city has not liked to take care of parks that are under 5 acres because of the loading and unloading equipment and time. She asked about the number of access points to the lake and noted that handicap van accessible parking spaces needed to be provided at each entrance. She asked about the size of the parking spaces.

Curtis Leavitt responded to questions of the size for the parking spaces. They are 20 feet deep and the parking isle is 25 feet deep and the strips of landscaping on either side are 5 or 6 feet.

Sandra Steele thought when they are requiring public restrooms at a park that it should be the city who maintains that. She asked about the landscaping at the north end of the Redwood Road area and if the sensitive area was native vegetation. She is concerned about that because it is what they did along the golf course and she thinks it doesn't look good and has been taken over by thistles and weeds. She asked if it was a requirement that it be natural.

Sarah Carroll said she would need to check with Engineering.

Sandra Steele would prefer to see it xeriscaped, if they had to make a choice.

Hayden Williamson addressed the fencing; he understood the noise issues and would support the privacy if it wouldn't go against code. He is in favor of the city taking over the open space for areas that are trail connectives for the city, but they could figure out how to maintain their smaller parks. He doesn't see the smaller parks getting a lot of use from the whole city.

Eric Reese asked applicant why they didn't want to have an HOA.

Curtis Leavitt replied it was to give the owners the right to own their lots fee simple and not having an HOA to dictate a lot of things they could and couldn't do. They would have to qualify for their loan with an HOA fee in the background.

Eric Reese then asked if he would be willing to entertain having a limited HOA just to maintain some areas.

Curtis Leavitt indicated that the challenges are insurance and resell-ability. If there were a tremendous amount of amenities he could see having an HOA.

Eric Reese would encourage applicant to look into an HOA to take care of the open space. For the fencing, he asked if they could put a berm along the trail to help with privacy.

Sarah Carroll indicated that a berm was required by the city.

Mike Kelly said there is a trail corridor that they can put in about 3 foot high berms.

Eric Reese would echo what the other commissioners have said. He likes the idea of semi-private fencing along the arterial road. He likes the sign proposed and thinks the development looks beautiful and appreciates the work they have done.

Kirk Wilkins said for the safety of residents and travelers he supports having the driveways as far away from the entrance roads as possible. He agrees with the 6' fence and walkways and the front setback. He commented that if all the open spaces were city maintained then construction needs to respect the city recommendations. He is in favor of no HOA, but again, if the city is maintaining it then they need to work with the city closely so it's not a liability. He is in favor of the additional play features and open spaces. If the city is to maintain it, then it needs to be built to the city's recommendations. He noted that the small green spaces can tend to become dog parks that do not get cleaned up. As for the fence he thinks they need to comply with pending ordinance. He noted that in other non HOA areas there are spots that do not get taken care of well like rocks that get a lot of weeds and things. He agrees with Sandra Steele that if there are restrooms in the park the city should maintain it. If they do have an HOA he would support them in all they wanted in a nice entrance and other things they want to make it a beautiful development.

Jeff Cochran said a lot of his comments echo Commissioner Wilkins. On the Fencing along Redwood Road, he thinks the solid fence will help with noise. He noted that Redwood Road would eventually be widened and the buffer would be lessened. He would support a solid fence but is torn with the direction the code is taking. He thanked them for bringing the development to the city and thinks it's beautiful. He thanked them for bringing driveways off Redwood Road access roads. He has mixed feelings on the parks; he does question how much outside residents would use the parks. He had a question on the southwest cul-de-sac and how it would work with future development, where some frontage of the circle met the edge of the plat.

Sarah Carroll replied that there is a drainage channel opposite of it and that they wouldn't be able to continue at that location to a future road. There is a stub just a little further east that will be easier to connect. Staff is asking that they keep it as a cul-de-sac.

Mike Kelly noted that if they pulled the cul-de-sac back it made for a lot of inaccessible area on the narrow triangle corner.

Jeff Cochran thought it was an odd looking cul-de-sac and suggested that they might want to relook at it again to gain more frontages on the cul-de-sac. He asked Sarah how much landscaping the city currently maintained.

Sarah Carroll answered that along Redwood Road they maintained the trail corridor in some spots, it was a variety throughout the city.

Jeff Cochran had mixed emotions about the HOA vs. having the city maintain it. He agrees with Commissioner Steel that they could have some sort of limited HOA to take care of the open space and they could then make it very beautiful. He thinks for this development an HOA would be able to take care of it better. He likes the phasing plan included.

#### Discussion on Motion

Sandra Steele wanted to look up the amount it took to take care of the open spaces. (Estimated figures found were about \$5000 a year per acre, \$1800 of that was for transportation of equipment)

Hayden Williamson wanted to discuss some things they could do to help with maintaining some of the open space. If there was to be an HOA then they could turn over more of the decisions to what would be in the parks to the developer.

Kirk Wilkins thought that if the parks were public with the city maintaining them, then there should maybe be some amenities added so it's not just a dog attraction and a source of contention.

Jeff Cochran asked Sarah if it was all or nothing on the open space.

Sarah Carroll replied that they could make a recommendation that the city accept certain spots and not others.

Staff recommended that the city accept the open spaces. She explained how the parks would eventually function as trailhead parks when the lakeshore trail was completed.

Hayden Williamson thought they could perhaps just do the one park.

Eric Reese thought they could propose that the city could take it all over and we support staff recommendation.

Jeff Cochran would like them to include in a motion that the developer reconsider the cul-de-sac area. He would support staff's recommendation on the open space.

Kirk Wilkins said he would support staff with the condition that they agree on the number of amenities that they put in and the level of improvements as they are taking on the liability for the maintenance.

Eric Reese would support staff recommendation.

Hayden Williamson did not support staff. He thought it was more of a local benefit.

Sandra Steele did not support the recommendation by staff because she thought someone would need to take care of the paths between homes and that would be a burden on the city. There were mixed emotions on the other open space. She thinks it could be a limited HOA to just maintain the open space. City could take care of parts.

Jeff Cochran summed up that there were mixed emotions concerning open space.

Sarah Carroll noted that they could defer that decision to City Council.

Curtis Leavitt said they asked themselves how they could open up the area so the city could use it more. He noted the area that they have put for the parks along the lake is the most desired area of the subdivision.

Some of the amenities are still to be determined. If they have to take it back to an HOA they may have to scale back and reconsider some of the amenities that are planned.

**Motion by Eric Reese that the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council to approve the Mallard Bay Preliminary Plat, located at approximately 2800-3000 South Redwood Road, with the findings and conditions identified in the staff report. With the added condition that the applicant look into ways to reconfigure the cul-de-sac in phase one. And that the monument sign as presented by the applicant be approved.**

Sandra Steele would like to see something to work on the sensitive lands area on the north to be better landscaped, not left to native plants.

Eric Reese **amended the motion to suggest that the applicant look into xeriscaping the sensitive lands area in phase 2 around the drainage channel.**

**Seconded by Sandra Steele**

**Aye: Sandra Steele, Eric Reese, Jeffrey Cochran, Kirk Wilkins. Nay: Hayden Williamson. Motion passed 4 - 1**

Mike Kelly asked what the thought was behind wanting the xeriscaping; he said they were maxed out on their turf at 70%.

Sandra Steele replied that her suggestion was either turf or xeriscaping but if it was a choice between rocks and weeds she would prefer not to see the weeds.

Sarah Carroll said they still had time to work it out and let's not make this decision here. If City Council accepted it as public parks than they would need to comply with city and they didn't need to take care of it tonight.

**6. Approval of Reports of Action.**

Sarah Carrol had the report of action on Mallard Bay, she went over Commissions discussion and the positive recommendation.

**Motion by Eric Reese to accept the report of action as presented by Sarah, Seconded by Sandra Steele. Aye: Sandra Steele, Hayden Williamson, Eric Reese, Jeffrey Cochran, Kirk Wilkins, Kara North, Jarred Henline. Motion passed unanimously**

**7. Approval of Minutes:**

1. September 11, 2014.

Sandra Steele noted she had phoned in some corrections.

**Motion by Eric Reese to approve the Minutes of September 11, 2014. Seconded by Kirk Wilkins. Aye: Sandra Steele, Hayden Williamson, Eric Reese, Jeffrey Cochran, Kirk Wilkins. Motion passed unanimously**

**8. Commission Comments.**

No comments given.

**9. Director's Report.**

Sarah Carroll reported on the last City Council meeting and upcoming agendas.

**Meeting adjourned without objection by Jeff Cochran**

**Adjourn 8:25 pm**

October 9, 2014  
Date of Approval

Lori Yates  
Lori Yates, City Recorder

